Final Report

Submitted to Buncombe County Board of County Commissioners

June 2022

****DRAFT DOCUMENT****

Table of Contents

Section I. Overview	
Section II. Committee's Summary of Outcomes	
Section III. Committee Meeting Agendas6	
Section IV. Level Setting	
Section V. Visioning	
Section VI. Strategic Recommendations10	
Addendum A. Request for Proposal: Property Appraisal Equity Analysis	
Addendum B. Syneva Report: Property Appraisal Equity Analysis	
Addendum C. Communication and Public Engagement Outreach Plan	
Addendum D. Community Input Survey Results	

I. Overview

The Ad Hoc Reappraisal Committee was formed and created by the Buncombe County Board of County Commissioners (BCBOCC) by resolution on September 7, 2021 with the following charge and purpose.

WHEREAS, recognizing that legally required tax assessments of real property and the reappraisal process are confusing and largely misunderstood, and in light of recent charges that the process is not equitable this Board desires to create an ad hoc committee;

WHEREAS, the goals of this committee would align with the County's Racial Equity Action Plan, including:

- 1. to identify citizen concerns,
- 2. provide guidance on future assessments, and
- 3. provide input into equity concerns;

WHEREAS, this committee will be comprised of seven members as follows:

- 7 members
 - 2 Members from the Board of Equalization and Review (Debbie Lane & Miriam McKinney)
 - 5 Community Members
 - 3 At-large members (Dwayne McAfee, Bobbette Mays, Melanie Pitrolo)
 - 1 Real Estate professional (residential preferred) (Jonathan Hunter)
 - 1 Equity representative (Brenda Mills)

WHEREAS, staff will consist of the Assessor, Chief Appraiser, a Tax Analyst, and a County Attorney

An eighth (8th) Committee member added after resolution passed by the BCBOCC (Ori Baber)

In addition, a **Planning Team** was formed consisting of:

Burnett Walz - Facilitator

Christina McEntee – Facilitator

Rachel Edens - Chief Equity & Human Rights Officer

Keith Miller – Property Assessment Officer

Sybil Tate – Assistant County Manager

Lillian Govus, Max Taintor, Kassi Day – Communication and Public Relations

The purpose of the Planning Team was to set agendas and assure that each committee meeting was fully supported and the group discussion was facilitated.

Syneva Economics Report to the Committee

A Request for Proposal (RFP) was issued for a Property Appraisal Equity Analysis on December 15th, 2021. (Appendix A) Syneva Economics was selected. Tom Tveidt with Syneva presented an overview of findings at a committee meeting. The full report is attached to this document (Appendix B)

Buncombe County Communications and Public Engagement Team (CAPE)

The CAPE Team was fully involved in supporting the Committee's efforts to identify citizen's concerns. To assure we casted the widest net with the most equitable approach, the CAPE Team developed an outreach plan with the input of the Committee members. (Addendum C) A Community Survey was administered with a response of 1200+ respondents that provided 500+ comments. (Addendum D) Public Comment was also held at most of the Committee meetings to allow the community an opportunity for direct communication with the committee.

Ad Hoc Reappraisal Committee II. Committee's Summary of Outcomes

Ad Hoc Reappraisal Committee Summary of Outcomes									
Key Vision Elements (page 9)	Expanded and accessible taxpayer assistance		Transparent, efficient, and effective stewardship of the county budget		Fair and equitable taxation practices in Buncombe County			Engaged and informed community resulting in increased knowledge of the property assessment process	
Strategic Direction (page 10)	Development of Nev Revenue Streams	V	Increase Capacity Assessment Department	E	Increase Education and Outreach		Hom Ass	se/Expand leowner istance lograms	Enhance Permitting Compliance
Actionable Recommendations (page 10)	 Treat AirBnB's as a business with a progressive tax Allocate short-term rental (AirBnB) revenue to fund Homeowner assistance program Support lobbying efforts to increase revenue streams – needs clarification 		 Develop process to correct the percentage of properties with incorrect attributes Increase frequency of property re- assessments (every 2-3 years) Develop key metrics to trigger increase in staff 	·	Leverage social media, faith-based organizations, and non-profits to engage and educate the community Hire community liaison to provide education on the appraisal process	•	exem in FL Reas on ex to ex	estead nption (like) ssess limits kemptions	 Conduct outreach campaign to Realtors Board & Builders Association Establish internal process for communication between Assessment & Permitting Dept's

III. Committee Meeting Agendas:

Public Comment was held at every committee meeting from December 8, 2021 – April 6, 2022

November 8, 2021:	Committee Orientation			
November 17 [,] 2021:	Kirk Boone, Teaching Assistant Professor in Public Finance and Government with the UNC School of G			
	Chris McLaughlin, Professor of Public Law and Government with the UNC School of Government			
December 8, 2021:	Dwight Mullin, Ph.D.			
January 12, 2022:	Larry Clark, Director of Strategic Initiatives with the International Association of Assessing Officers			
	Bi-laws			
	Community Survey development			
January 26, 2022:	Rachel Edens, Chief Equity & Human Rights Officer - Property Appraisal from an Equity Lens			
	John E. Hudson, Interim County Budget Director - Tax Rate vs. Property Appraisal			
	Eric Cregger, Tax Analyst - Buncombe County Property Assessment (PART 1)			
February 9, 2022:	(Virtual Meeting)			
	Communication and Public Engagement Team – Solicit feedback on Community Survey Outreach efforts			
	Keith Miller – Buncombe County Property Assessment (Part 2)			
February 23, 2022	(Virtual Meeting)			
	Rachel Edens - Racial Equity Action Plan Overview			
	Community Input Survey final report out			
	Keith Miller – Buncombe County Property Assessment (Part 3)			
March 9, 2022	Rachel Edens - Equity Analysis Tools			
	Tom Tveidt, Syneva Economics – Awarded the proposal bid to provide the County with a Residential Property Assessment Equity Data Analysis			

- April 6, 2022: Property Appraisal Process Simulation Hands-on activity to simulate Property Appraisal, Appeals, and the Exemption process
- April 20, 2022: Urban 3, Joe Minicozzi At the request of Brownie Newman, Board Chair. This presentation was originally made to the BCBOCC which precipitated the creation of the Ad Hoc Reappraisal Committee
- May 4, 2022: Visioning (see section V)
- May 18, 2022 Creation of Recommendations (see section VI)
- June 1, 2022 Wrap up

IV. Level Setting

Committee Members selected for the Ad Hoc Reappraisal Committee came in with varying backgrounds, experience, levels of understanding, and subject matter expertise. In an effort to bring committee members together on some common ground, subject matter experts were invited by the planning team with the goal of level setting basic understanding of property appraisal rules, laws, historical and current equity perspective, and current assessment office operations.

Guest Educator	Key Take-away
Kirk Boone: Teaching Assistant Professor in Public Finance	✓ Role and responsibility of the assessor
and Government with the UNC School of Government	 Property appraisal methodology and standards
Chris McLaughlin: Professor of Public Law and Government	✓ State Law governing the property appraisal process
with the UNC School of Government	✓ What local governments can and cannot do
Dr. Dwight Mullen, PhD: Retired Professor and Historian	✓ History of black homeownership in Buncombe County
	✓ The impact of public policy decisions, and their negative
	outcomes for underserved populations
Larry Clark: Director of Strategic Initiatives with the	 Data which an assessor must consider
International Association of Assessing Officers	✓ Why is the data important?
	✓ How the data tells the story
Rachel Edens, Buncombe County Chief Equity & Human	 Property Appraisal from an equity lens
Rights Officer	✓ Equity vs. equality
	✓ Racial Equity Action Plan overview
	 Developing recommendations with equity considerations
	✓ Equity Analysis Tools for decision making
Keith Miller, Buncombe County Property Assessment Officer	✓ An overview of the assessment process in Buncombe County

V. Visioning

Key Vision Elements	Expanded and accessible taxpayer assistance	Transparent, efficient, and effective stewardship of the county budget	Fair and equitable taxation practices in Buncombe County	Engaged and informed community resulting in increased knowledge of the property assessment process
Detailed vision items	There continues to be grand funding dollars for taxpayers who need assistance	County budget thoughtfulness	Primary vs secondary home or investment (S.C. model)	Expand education on re- appraisal process
	The County funds thru local, nonprofits housing repair programs specifically to assist elderly and disadvantaged residents	The property office has been expanded by the County with additional personnel to assist homeowners more with appeals	Tax Air B&Bs as a business vs. single family home	On-going education for property owners on appeals
	Expand rebate program to include low and moderate income	Re-appraisal ambassador or liaison	Tax short-term vs long-term at a different rate	Better representation in the appraisal system (perception of fairness)
	Increase the limits to tax exemption			Clear and transparent process on re-appraisal

VI. Strategic Directions and Actionable Recommendations

Still a work in progress. Will finalize on June 1st and insert them on this page